# JEFFERSON PARISH SCHOOL DISTRICT APPEAL LETTER TO USAC WITH DOCUMENTATION



# **TECHNOLOGY DIVISION**

# JEFFERSON PARISH PUBLIC SCHOOL SYSTEM

4600 RIVER ROAD MARRERO, LOUISIANA 70072-1943 (504) 349-8929 FAX: (504) 349-7888 www.jppss.k12.la.us

JAMES MEZA, JR. Ed. D. Acting Superintendent

MABLE J. MOORE, Ph.D. CTO/Assistant Superintendent

November 4, 2011

# LETTER TO APPEAL SERVICE START DATE DECISION ON FORM 500 USAC APPLICATION 864942

Erate Coordinator/Contact:	John Herndon		
	Director Network Services		
Address:	Jefferson Parish School District		
	4600 River Road		
	Marrero, LA 70072-1943		
Phone:	504.349.8546		
Fax:	504.349.7685		
Email address:	john.herndon@jppss.k12.la.us		
Applicant/Appellant:	John Herndon (for Jefferson Parish School District)		
Applicant BEN:	139210		
Service Provider:	BellSouth Communication Systems LLC		
Service Provider SPIN:	143011959		
Form 500 Number Assigned by USAC:	864942		
FRN:	1993160		
Appealing Decision:	Service Start Date: 10/5/2010*		
Outcome Requested:	Change Service Start Date to 7/1/2010		
Documentation:	Invoices (5); Form 500 NL; FCC DA 06-244		



# TECHNOLOGY DIVISION

# JEFFERSON PARISH PUBLIC SCHOOL SYSTEM

4600 RIVER ROAD MARRERO, LOUISIANA 70072-1943 (504) 349-8929 FAX: (504) 349-7888 www.jppss.k12.la.us

JAMES MEZA, JR. Ed. D. Acting Superintendent

MABLE J. MOORE, Ph.D. CTO/Assistant Superintendent

November 4, 2011

John Herndon Director Network Services Jefferson Parish School District 4600 River Road Marrero, LA 70072-1943

Letter of Appeal

Schools and Libraries Division – Correspondence Unit 30 Laindex Plaza West PO Box 685 Parsippany, NJ 07054-0685 appeals@sl.universalservice.org

RE: APPEAL OF SERVICE START DATE CHANGE DECISION FOR APPLICATION 864942

Dear Sir or Madam:

I respectfully request your consideration of my Appeal to USAC's decision to change the 486 SSD to 10/5/2010 instead of 7/1/2010 which was listed as the new start date change on form 500.

Citing the attached FCC DA 06-244 (Glendale Unified School District), please refer to items 3 and 5. We feel that we also made "an unintentional, clerical error but adhered to the core program requirements."

- Our 471 application for Basic Maintenance consisted of five components, four of which we actually began receiving services on 7/1/2010. The fifth component (Smartnet) was the only one of the five that services did not begin until 12/10/2010. The incorrect date of 12/10/2010 was inadvertently listed as the SSD on the 486 when 7/1/2010 was the correct SSD to cover all five components in this application.
- Invoices for all five components are attached to show a Smartnet invoice with the contract date beginning 12/10/10.
- Form 471 was filed online and ecertified within the filing window and reflected the correct SSD of 7/1/2010. The FCDL was issued 12/28/10.
- Form 486 was filed online and ecertified within the filing window but contained a clerical error on the SSD. The error was not discovered until the filing of our BEAR form.

Thank you for your consideration of my request.

John Herndon, Director Network Services

cc: Brett Behrens - bb3632@att.com

# FORM 500 NOTIFICATION LETTER REPORT (Funding Year 2010)

Funding Request Number (FRN): 1993160
Form 471 Application Number: 737965
Service Provider Name: BellSouth Communication Systems LLC
Service Provider Identification Number (SPIN): 143011959
Billing Account Number: 5043497600
Service Start Date: 10/05/2010\*
Service Start Date Change Explanation: 120-DAY 500 DEADLINE



00046

# Before the Federal Communications Commission Washington, DC 20554

In the Matter of	)	
Request for Review and/or Waiver of the Decision of the Universal Service Administrator by	)	
Glendale Unified School District Glendale, California	)	File No. SLD-143548
Schools and Libraries Universal Service Support Mechanism	)	CC Docket No. 02-6
	ODDED	

Adopted: February 1, 2006 Released: February 1, 2006

By the Deputy Chief, Wireline Competition Bureau:

### I. INTRODUCTION

1. Glendale Unified School District, Glendale, California, (Glendale) filed a Request for Review and/or Waiver of a decision by the Universal Service Administrative Company (USAC or Administrator). The USAC decision at issue denied funding for discounted services in Funding Year 2003 of the schools and libraries universal service mechanism. As explained below, we find that special circumstances exist to justify a waiver of the Commission's rules and remand the application associated with this appeal to USAC for further action consistent with this Order.

# II. BACKGROUND

2. Under the schools and libraries universal service support mechanism, eligible schools, libraries, and consortia that include eligible schools and libraries, may apply for discounts for eligible telecommunications services, Internet access, and internal connections.<sup>2</sup> Once the school or library has complied with the Commission's competitive bidding requirements and entered into agreements for eligible services, it must file an FCC Form 471 application to notify the Administrator of the services that have been ordered, the service providers with whom the applicant has entered into an agreement, and an estimate of funds needed to cover the discounts to be given for eligible services.<sup>3</sup> Also on the FCC Form 471, applicants must list the "service start date," the date on which services will start in the funding year

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Letter from Mary W. Boger and Michael F. Escalante, Glendale Unified School District, Glendale, California, to Federal Communications Commission, filed November 4, 2005 (Request for Review and/or Waiver). Section 54.719(c) of the Commission's rules provides that any person aggrieved by an action taken by a division of the Universal Service Administrative Company may seek review from the Commission. 47 C.F.R. § 54.719(c).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> 47 C.F.R. §§ 54.501-54.503.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> 47 C.F.R. § 54.504(c); Instructions for Completing the Universal Service Schools and Libraries Services Ordered and Certification Form (FCC Form 471), OMB 3060-0806 (December 2002) (FCC Form 471 Instructions).

for which applicants are applying.<sup>4</sup> USAC then issues a funding commitment decision letter indicating the discounts, if any, to which the applicant is entitled. After the funding year begins and the discounted service commences, the approved recipient of discounted services submits to USAC an FCC Form 486, which indicates that the service has begun and demonstrates approval of technology plans.<sup>5</sup> Applicants must list the actual service start date on the FCC Form 486.<sup>6</sup> USAC will only accept invoices from the service provider and issue disbursements for discounts on eligible services after receipt of the FCC Form 486.<sup>7</sup>

3. Glendale filed its FCC Form 471 for Funding Request Numbers (FRNs) 980062 and 980113 on February 4, 2003, noting that the service start date for the two FRNs was July 1, 2003. Glendale received its Funding Commitment Decision Letter on March 3, 2004 and filed its FCC Form 486 on March 8, 2004. On its FCC Form 486, Glendale listed its funding year service start date as March 8, 2004, the date that it submitted the form to USAC, instead of July 1, 2003, the actual service start date. On June 22, 2004, Glendale submitted its FCC Form 472 Billed Entity Applicant Reimbursement Form (BEAR Form), seeking reimbursement for work billed from November 2003 to May 2004 pursuant to FRNs 980062 and 980113. On November 19, 2004, USAC sent Glendale notification that it was not reimbursing certain expenses associated with the FRNs 980062 and 980113 because the service start date was before the services received date on the FCC Form 486. On November 4, 2005, Glendale then filed the instant Request for Review and/or Waiver with the Commission.

# III. DISCUSSION

4. The Commission may waive any provision of its rules on its own motion and for good cause shown.<sup>14</sup> A rule may be waived where the particular facts make strict compliance inconsistent with

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> FCC Form 471 Instructions at 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Instructions for Completing the Schools and Libraries Universal Service, Receipt of Service Confirmation Form (FCC Form 486), OMB 3060-0853 (August 2003) at 2 (FCC Form 486 Instructions).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> FCC Form 486 Instructions at 12-13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> FCC Form 486 Instructions at 2. See also Federal-State Joint Board on Universal Service, Children's Internet Protection Act, CC Docket No. 96-45, Order, 17 FCC Rcd 12443, 12444, para. 4 (2002) (CIPA II Order); 47 C.F.R. § 54.520.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> FCC Form 471, Glendale Unified School District, certified February 4, 2003 (Glendale FCC Form 471).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Letter from Schools and Libraries Division, Universal Service Administrative Company, to Patrick Kennedy, Glendale Unified School District, dated March 3, 2004 (Funding Commitment Decision Letter); FCC Form 486, Glendale Unified School District, dated March 8, 2004 (Glendale FCC Form 486).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Glendale FCC Form 486 at 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> FCC Form 472 Billed Entity Applicant Reimbursement Form, Glendale Unified School District, dated June 22, 2004 (Glendale BEAR Form).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Letter from Schools and Libraries Division, Universal Service Administrative Company, to Patrick Kennedy, Glendale Unified School District, dated November 19, 2004 (Form 472 (BEAR Form) Notification Letter).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Request for Review and/or Waiver.

<sup>14 47</sup> C.F.R. §1.3.

the public interest.<sup>15</sup> In addition, the Commission may take into account considerations of hardship, equity, or more effective implementation of overall policy on an individual basis.<sup>16</sup> In sum, waiver is appropriate if special circumstances warrant a deviation from the general rule, and such deviation would better serve the public interest than strict adherence to the general rule.<sup>17</sup>

Based on the facts and circumstances in this specific case, we waive the relevant Commission rules and procedures. We find that although Glendale committed an unintentional, clerical error when it listed the incorrect service start date on its FCC Form 486, it adhered to the core program requirements. As we recently noted, the E-rate program is fraught with complexity from the perspective of beneficiaries, resulting in a significant number of applications for E-rate support being denied for ministerial or clerical errors. 18 We find that the action we take here promotes the statutory requirements of section 254(h) of the Communications Act of 1934, as amended (the "Act"), by helping to ensure that Glendale obtains access to discounted telecommunications and information services. 19 Although processing standards are necessary for the efficient administration of the program, strict adherence to such application procedures in this case would result in an outcome conflicting with the statutory goal mandated by Congress of preserving and advancing universal service among schools and libraries most in need of support. As we consider fundamental reform to the schools and libraries universal service mechanism, the public interest and goals of section 254(h) of the Act are best served by waiving our rules pertaining to Glendale's failure to insert the correct service start date on its FCC Form 486. We therefore grant a waiver to Glendale and remand its application to USAC for further action consistent with this order.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Northeast Cellular Telephone Co. v. FCC, 897 F.2d 1164, 1166 (D.C. Cir. 1990) (Northeast Cellular).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> WAIT Radio v. FCC, 418 F.2d 1153, 1157, (D.C. Cir. 1969), affirmed by WAIT Radio v. FCC, 459 F.2d 1203 (D.C. Cir. 1972), cert. denied, 409 U.S. 1027 (1972).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Northeast Cellular, 897 F.2d at 1166.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Comprehensive Review of Universal Service Fund Management, Administration, and Oversight, Federal-State Joint Board on Universal Service, Schools and Libraries Universal Service Support Mechanism, Rural Health Care Support Mechanism, Lifeline and Linkup, Changes to the Board of Directors of the National Exchange Carrier Association, Inc., WC Docket Nos. 05-195, 02-60, 03-109, CC Docket Nos. 96-45, 02-6, 97-21, Notice of Proposed Rulemaking and Further Notice of Proposed Rulemaking, 20 FCC Rcd 11308 (2005) (Comprehensive Review NPRM).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> 47 U.S.C. § 254(h). The Telecommunications Act of 1996, Pub. L. No. 104-104, 110 Stat. 56, amended the Communications Act of 1934.

# IV. ORDERING CLAUSE

- 6. ACCORDINGLY, IT IS ORDERED that, pursuant to the authority contained in sections 1-4 and 254 of the Communications Act of 1934, as amended, 47 U.S.C. §§ 151-154 and 254, and pursuant to authority delegated in sections 0.91, 0.291, 1.3 and 54.722(a) of the Commission's rules, 47 C.F.R. §§ 0.91, 0.291, 1.3 and 54.722(a), that the Request for Review and/or Waiver filed by Glendale Unified School District, Glendale, California, IS GRANTED.
- 7. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, pursuant to the authority contained in sections 1-4 and 254 of the Communications Act of 1934, as amended, 47 U.S.C. §§ 151-154 and 254, and pursuant to authority delegated in sections 0.91, 0.291, 1.3 and 54.722(a) of the Commission's rules, 47 C.F.R. §§ 0.91, 0.291, 1.3 and 54.722(a), that the Request for Review and/or Waiver filed by Glendale Unified School District, Glendale, California, IS REMANDED to the Administrator for further consideration in accordance with the terms of this Order.

FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION

Dana R. Shaffer Deputy Chief Wireline Competition Bureau